

The Cakrabhedavastu of Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*

Hong Luo⁽¹⁾

The Cakrabhedavastu is the fifteenth chapter of Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* (henceforth, VS). It deals with the schism of the wheel of Dharma (*dharmacakrabheda*), in its abbreviated form, the schism of the wheel (*cakrabheda*), one of the two categories of the schism of community (*saṃghabheda*),⁽²⁾ another being the schism of the ecclesiastical action (*karmabheda*), which is the subject of the fourteenth chapter of the VS.⁽³⁾ The schism of the wheel is doctrinally oriented, while the schism of the ecclesiastical action is concerned with the ritual performance in the community.

The textual relationship between the *Abhidharmakośa* (henceforth, AK) and the VS is a topic calling for further investigation. In the case of Karmabheda and Cakrabhedavastu, the impact of the former is nonetheless obvious, as indicated by the many citations from the AK and the AK related literature in the interpretations given in the para-canonical commentaries of the VS.

In Karmanirdeśa, the fourth chapter of the AK (IV.98-102), the schism of the Wheel is identified as the major type of the schism of the community:⁽⁴⁾

saṃghabhedas tv asāmagrī-svabhāvo viprayuktakaḥ | akliṣṭāvyākṛto dharmakaḥ AK 4.98abc

⁽¹⁾ The first draft of this chapter was accomplished in 2011, I thank the China Tibetology Research Center (中国藏学研究中心) for supporting my study on Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra* over many years. The final phase of my study on this chapter is financed by Sichuan University (project number 2018hhs-61) and Sichuan University Research Cluster for Regional History and Frontier Studies (project number xkqzd2018-06).

⁽²⁾ Guṇaprabha declares this at the very beginning of VSS 15.1.

⁽³⁾ Luo *forthcoming*.

⁽⁴⁾ *cakrabhedaḥ sa ca mataḥ* || AK 4.101a *dharmacakram hi tadā bhagavato bhinnam bhavati | mārgaprayrttiṣṭhāpanāt | ata eva cakrabhedaś cocyate saṃghabhedas ca* | (AKBh: 261). There is yet another type of schism of the community, which results from the disagreement concerning the ritual performance: *anyas tu saṃghabhedakaḥ karmabhedaḥ bhavati | yady ekasūmāyām vyagrāḥ karma kurvanti* | (AKBh: 728)

The schism of the community is a [conditioned (*saṃskāraḥ*)] factor which by nature consists of no component (*asāmagrīsvabhāvaḥ*); which is not associated with [mental factors] (*viprayuktaḥ*); which is neither veiled nor defined (*akliṣṭāvyākṛtaḥ*).

The committer of the schism of the community should be a monk (*bhikṣu*), neither a layman, nor a nun; he should be one who holds [heretic] views (*dṛkcaritaḥ*),⁽⁵⁾ not one who is given to [mundane] desires (*trṣṇācaritaḥ*);⁽⁶⁾ and he should [still] be keeping the disciplinary rules (*vṛttī*), not one whose disciplinary rules have become corrupted (*bhinnavṛttaḥ*), because instructions from such a one will not be endorsed [by members in the community] (*anādeyavākya*).⁽⁷⁾

The schism of the community can only happen in a place other than where the Buddha stays, it is only possible to split the ordinary members [in the community], it can only be accomplished when an instructor and his instructions other than the Buddha and the Buddha's teachings are accepted, and it can last for only one night.⁽⁸⁾

Cakrabhedha can only be committed in the central continent (*jambūdvīpa*). Besides, a minimum of 9 individuals is required, i.e., four for each of the two opposing sides, i.e., the side following the Buddha and that following the splitter,⁽⁹⁾ and the splitter, who is separately counted.⁽¹⁰⁾

There are time periods when the schism does not occur:

ādāv ante 'rbudāt pūrvam yugāc coparate munau | sīmāyām cāpy abaddhāyām cakrabhedo na jāyate || AK 4.102 ||

(5) This compound could either be understood as a *saptamītatpuruṣa*: one who acts according to the five heretic views, or a *bahuvrīhi*: one whose behavior is the [heretic] views, i.e., he who persuades others to accept heretic teachings: *sa ca dṛṣṭicarita eva dṛḍhagūdhāśrayatvāt satkāyadṛṣṭyādiṣu pañcasu caritaḥ pravṛtto dṛṣṭicaritaḥ, dṛṣṭir vā caritam a-syeti dṛṣṭicaritaḥ sa hy ūhāpohasāmāthyād anyam śāstāraṃ mārgāntaraṃ ca grāhayituṃ samārthaḥ*. (AKVy: 726-727)

(6) A monk who sways between the two sides of defilements and purification: *na trṣṇācarita iti saṅkleśavyavadānapakṣayor asthirāśayatvāt* | (AKVy: 727)

(7) *bhikṣur dṛkcarito vṛttī, bhinatti || AK 4.100ab bhikṣur bhinatti na grhī na bhikṣuṇyādayaḥ | sa ca dṛṣṭicarita eva na trṣṇācaritaḥ | vṛttastho na bhinnavṛttas tasyānādeyavākyaṭvāt* | (AKBh: 726-727).

(8) *anyatra || 4.100b na hi śāstur eva saṃnidhau śakyo bhettum | tathāgatānām duṣprasahatvād ādeyavākyaṭvāc ca | kān bhinatti | bālīśān || 4.100b pṛthagjanān eva nāryān pratyakṣadharmaṭvāt | tān api na kṣāntilābhina ity apare | kiya-tā bhinnāḥ saṃgho bhavati | śāstrīmārgāntarakṣāntau bhinnāḥ || 4.100cd yadā tebhyaḥ tathāgatād anyāḥ śāstā kṣamate tadupadiṣṭāc ca mārgād anyo mārga iyatā bhinnāḥ saṃgho vaktavyaḥ | kiyaṇam kālāḥ bhinna āste | tām eva rātriṃ na vivasaty asau || 4.100d aparyuṣita eva hi saṃghabhede saṃgho 'vaśyaṃ pratisaṃdhīyate* | (AKBh: 727)

(9) *avaśyaṃ hi saṅghena dvayoḥ pakṣayoḥ sthātavyam iti buddhapakṣe bhetṭripakṣe ca sthātavyam ity arthaḥ* | (AKVy: 728)

(10) *kva punaś cakrabhedo bhavati | jambūdvīpe || 4.101b nānyeṣu dvīpeṣu | katibhir bhikṣubhiḥ | navādibhiḥ || 4.101b navādiṃ kṛtvā | pareṇāniyamaḥ | aṣṭau bhikṣavaḥ saṃgho bhavati | navamo bhetṭā | avaśyaṃ hi saṅghena dvayoḥ pakṣayoḥ sthātavyam | evaṃ bhinnō bhavati* | (AKBh: 728)

[Two periods of the initial phase, i.e.,] at the beginning [when the Wheel of Dharma had just been set in motion], at the end [when the Buddha entered *nirvāṇa*]; [four periods of the middle phase, i.e.,] before the [occurrence of] the tumour [of disciplinary rules and view] [in the community], before the two foremost Hearers (*śrāvakāgrayugam*), [i.e., Śāradvatīputraḥ, the foremost among those who have profound wisdom and Mahāmaudgalyāyana, the foremost among those who have supernatural powers,] at the time when the Buddha entered *nirvāṇa* and when the ecclesiastical boundary has not been established.

The schism of the wheel of Dharma is one of the five capital sins which incur immediate retribution (*ānantarya*).

The Cakrabhedavastu is the shortest chapter in the VS, it consists of only four *sūtras*. A synopsis as given by dGe 'dun grub pa (1391–1475) in his *Legs par gsungs pa'i dam pa'i chos 'dul ba mtha' dag gi snying po'i don legs par bshad pa rin po che'i 'phreng ba*, one of the most important and most studied para-canonical commentaries on the VS, neatly outlines the structure of this chapter:

- 1 The characteristics of the action (*sbyor ba'i mtshan nyid*) [VS.15.1]
 - 1.1 Schism due to a motion of the matters deviated from the teaching of emancipation (*chos thar pa'i lam las tha dad pa'i dngos por gsol bas 'byed pa*)
 - 1.2 Schism due to an appeal for voting by tally sticks in accordance with the matters announced (*ji skad bshad pa'i don des tshul shing len du 'jug pas 'byed pa*)
- 2 The exclusion of the basis (*gzhi'i sel ba*) [VS.15.2]
- 3 The characteristics of the mental status (*bsam pa'i mtshan nyid*) [VS.15.3-4]

A critical edition of the Sanskrit text of the Cakrabhedavastu has been prepared on the basis of two manuscripts⁽¹¹⁾ together with two Tibetan translations. The first one marked as translation a is from the Tibetan translation of the VS, translation b is the *pratīkas* collected from the VSV.⁽¹²⁾

Sanskrit and Tibetan texts of the Cakrabhedavastu

Svs.15.1 jñāpanato⁽¹³⁾ vā prthagbhāvasya dharmāt saṃghabhedaḥ śalākāgrahaṇato vānenārthe-na || [A105r2][B58v4]

Tvs.15.1a dge 'dun gyi dbyen ni chos las tha dad pa'i dngos por gsol bas sam don des tshul shing

⁽¹¹⁾ For details about the manuscripts and other related textual witnesses, see Luo 2009, 2011.

⁽¹²⁾ For the different Tibetan translations of the VS, see Luo 2009a.

⁽¹³⁾ jñāpanato em.: jñāpanato AB

len du 'jug pas so || [D89v7][G][N][P98r2]

Tvs.15.1b chos las tha dad du 'gyur ba ni gsol ba'am tshul shing len⁽¹⁴⁾ pa ste | de'i phyir gyis na dge 'dun gyi dbyen no || [D317r2][G][N][P392r3]

Svs.15.2 arūḍhir asyāsaṃghaparimāṇatve bhidyamānānām asattve cānyeṣām antaḥsīmni saṃghaparimāṇānām || [A105r2][B58v3]

Tvs.15.2a dbye bar bya ba dag dge 'dun gyi tshad nyid ma yin pa dang | mtshams kyi nang na gzhan dge 'dun gyi tshad dag kyang med pa yin na de ni mi 'chags so || [D90r1][G][N][P98r3]

Tvs.15.2b 'di mi skye ba ni dge 'dun gyi tshad du cha med pa dang dbye bar byed pa na⁽¹⁵⁾ gzhan dang mtshams kyi nang gi dge 'dun kyi tshad du med na'o || [D317r5][G][N][P392r6]

Svs.15.3 adharmadharmaḥ pratyavagatāv ānantaryam || [A105r3][B58v3]

Tvs.15.3a chos dang chos ma yin pa gnyis ka de bzhin du shes na mtshams med pa'o || [D90r1][G][N][P98r4]

Tvs.15.3b chos dang chos ma yin pa de'i rang bzhin gyis gdon mi za bar na mtshams med pa'o || [D317r7][G][N][P392v2]

Svs.15.4 dharmasaṃjñīno 'pi bhede || [A105r3][B58v3]

Tvs.15.4a dbye ba⁽¹⁶⁾ la chos su 'du shes pas kyang ngo || [D90r1][G][N][P98r4]

Tvs.15.4b chos su 'du shes na'ang 'byed par ro || [D317v2][G][N][P392v5]

Svs.15 cakrabhedavastu || || [A105r3][B58v4]

⁽¹⁴⁾ len D: lan P

⁽¹⁵⁾ na D: ni P

⁽¹⁶⁾ dbye ba D: dbyen P

Tvs.15a 'khor lo dbye⁽¹⁷⁾ ba'i gzhi'o || || [D90r2][G][N][P98r4]

Tvs.15b 'khor lo bye ba'i dngos po'o || || [D317v3][G][N][P392v6]

Annotated translation of the Cakrabhedavastu

VS.15.1⁽¹⁸⁾ The Schism of the community (*saṃghabhedah*)⁽¹⁹⁾ [arises] either from a motion (*jñāpanataḥ*)⁽²⁰⁾ for a matters deviated from the teachings (*dharma*)⁽²¹⁾ or (*vā*) from taking tally sticks (*śālākāgrahaṇataḥ*)⁽²²⁾ for that purpose (*anenārthena*).⁽²³⁾

VS.15.2 A [schism] does not arise (*arūdhiḥ*) if the number of the [members] split [by the splitter] (*bhidyamānānām*)⁽²⁴⁾ does not reach the size [required] of a community⁽²⁵⁾ and the number of the other [members] (*anyeṣām*) within the [same] boundary⁽²⁶⁾ does not meet the size [required] of a community (*saṃghaparimāṇānām*).⁽²⁷⁾ either.

(17) dbye D: bye P

(18) There are different ways to interpret this *sūtra*, our translation follows the VSS and the VST. According to the VSVy and the VSV, *prthagbhāvasya dharmāt* and *anenārthena* govern both *jñāpanataḥ* and *śālākāgrahaṇataḥ*, in the VSS and the VST, however, *prthagbhāvasya dharmāt* is syntactically construed with *jñāpanataḥ*, while *anenārthena*, *śālākāgrahaṇataḥ*.

(19) In the VSS *saṃghabhedah* is defined as being *cakrabhedha* by nature: 'khor lo bye ba'i bdag nyid dge 'dun gyi dbyen la ji ltar bsgrub par bya zhe na | ... This is obviously a paraphrase of the thesis in the *Abhidharmakośa*: *cakrabhedah sa ca mataḥ* (AK 4.101a)

(20) Both manuscripts read *jñapanataḥ*, we have standardized the reading. But *jñapti* for *jñāpti* is attested in BHSD(: 244). The motion is proposed by the splitter to the members who accept the matters contrasting the right teachings: *de las tha dad pa'i dngos por bya ba'i phyir 'gyed par byed pa'i gang zag gis chos ma yin pa'i phyogs dang mthun pa'i dge 'dun la gsol bas | dge 'dun 'byed par byed pa'o ||* (VST 15.1.2) The announcement (*sngags*) of the so-called Five Matters of Mahādeva is given in VST 15.1.3.

(21) The way leading to emancipation: 'dir chos zhes bya ba ni thar pa'i lam yang dag par gyur pa ste | (VSS 15.1)

(22) According to Guṇaprabha and Dharmamitra, "from causing to take tally sticks", which means that the splitter makes an announcement calling for such a procedure, see VSS 15.1 and VST 15.1.4.

(23) For the purpose of supporting the issue deviated from the teachings for emancipation, cf. VSS 15.1, VST 15.1.4. For the announcement (*sngags*) for summoning such a vote, see VST 15.1.5. The equivalent of *anenārthena* in the VSVy seems to be *gcugs gzhug pa'i phyir*/for the sake of creating discord. Passingly, an archaic variant of *gcugs*, *gtsugs*, is attested in VSVy 15.3. The orthographical inconsistency again suggests that the VSVy had undergone less textual revision.

(24) With regard to *bhidyamānānām* there is a divergence between the two groups of Tibetan translations. While *dbye bar bya ba dag* in G1 is doubtless the equivalent to *bhidyamānānām*, *dbye bar byed pa na* in G2, however, suggests *bhindānānām*. Our translation follows the Sanskrit text and G1's interpretation.

(25) There seems to be a divergence between the VSS and the VST concerning whether the splitter should be counted among the members split. VSS (15.2) suggests that the splitter should be included: *dbye bar byed pa po las dbye bar bya ba nyid ni ma yin no || de lta bas na lhan cig tu 'di rnams la dge 'dun gyi tshad nyid rten par shes par bya'o*, VST (15.2), however, explicitly dismisses this: 'dir dge 'dun gyi tshad ni bzhi yan chad do || 'byed par byed pa nyid kyi chos ma yin pa'i phyogs kyi dge 'dun gyi kha bskang du yang mi rung ngo. On this matter, the VSVy and the VSV agree with the VST, see VSVy 15.2, VSV 15.2.

(26) This is a prerequisite for schism: *ekasīmāyām hi pakṣadvayāvasthānāt saṃghabhedha iti*. (AKBh: 262)

(27) The minimum number of a community is four, cf. VSS 15.2 and VST 15.2. The occurrence of a schism requires at

VS.15.3⁽²⁸⁾ The immediate retribution (*ānantaryam*)⁽²⁹⁾ [is incurred only] when [the splitter] understands the nature of dharma and non-dharma (*adharmadharmaḥ tathātvena pratyavagatau*).⁽³⁰⁾

VS.15.4 When a schism [is done], even [the splitter] considers [the schism] doctrinally correct (*dharmasamjñinah*), [the immediate retribution will still be incurred].⁽³¹⁾

The matter of schism of [Dharma]cakra (*cakrabhedavastu*) [is accomplished].

Abbreviations and sigla

AK Vasubandhu's *Abhidharmakośa*, Shastri 1971

AKBh Vasubandhu's *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*, Shastri 1971

AKVy Yaśomitra's *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā*, Shastri 1971

Svs 15.@ The critical edition of the Sanskrit text of the Cakrabhedavastu

Tvs 15.@a The Tibetan translation of the Cakrabhedavastu in the VS

Tvs 15.@b The *pratīka* of the Cakrabhedavastu in the VSV

VS Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*

VSS Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtravṛttyabhidhānasavyākhyāna*

VSVy Prajñākara's *Vinayasūtravyākhyāna*

VSV Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtravṛtti*

Bibliography

Luo Hong (罗 鸿)

2009

A Preliminary Report on A Newly Identified Sanskrit Manuscript of the *Vinayasūtra* from Tibet. In: *Sanskrit Manuscripts in China. Proceedings of a Panel at the 2008 Beijing Seminar on Tibetan Studies, October 13 to 17*. 197-226.

least 9 members from the same community, four among them follow the right teachings and four side with the splitter who disclaims the right teachings, cf. VSV 15.2. See also the *Abhidharmakośa*: *navādhīḥ* || AK 4.101b

(28) This *sūtra* specifies the mental status of the one on whom the immediate retribution falls.

(29) A definition of *ānantarya* is given in the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*: *ānantāryaṇīti ko 'rthaḥ | nāntarāyitum śakyāni vipākam prati janmāntaraphalena karmāntareṇety ānantaryāṇi | na tiraskartum ity arthaḥ | na vā tatkāriṇaḥ pudgalasyetaścyutasyānantaram asti narakopapattigamanam prati ānantaraḥ | tadbhāva ānantaryam | yasya dharmasya yogāt so 'nantaro bhavati | śrāmaṇyavat* | (AKBh: 259)

(30) Literally, 'when dharma and non-dharma are understood according to [their] nature'. It is noteworthy that as an elaboration, an episode between the Buddha and Devadatta is supplied in VSV 15.3.

(31) The issue at stake is whether a buddhist should embrace whole-heartedly the *nirupadhiśeṣanirvāṇa* or not. The splitter, represented by Devadatta, downplays its religious significance and recommends a secular practice. The VSS and the VST underscore its soteriological value and further assert that when individuals involved in such a confrontation even a doubt about the merit of the *nirupadhiśeṣanirvāṇa* would incur the immediate retribution. Whether such a doubt would lead to *ānantaryam* is not discussed in the VSVy and the VSV.

2009a

A Brief Survey of the Tibetan Translation of the *Vinayasūtra* in the 'Dul ba mdo'i 'grel pa. In: *Buddhist and Pali Studies in Honor of the Venerable Professor Kakkapaliye Anuruddha*. Hong Kong. 299-342.

2011

The Recensions of Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*: Towards an Editorial Policy for the Critical Edition of the Sanskrit Text, *Annali - Rivista del Dipartimento di Studi Asiatici e del Dipartimento di Studi e Ricerche su Africa e Paesi Arabi, Università degli Studi di Napoli L'Orientale, Napoli*, 67/2007, 171–186.

forthcoming

The Karmabhedavastu of Guṇaprabha's *Vinayasūtra*.

SHASTRI Swami Dwarikadas 1971

Abhidharmakośa and Bhāṣya of Ācārya Vasubandhu with Sphuṭārthā Commentary of Ācārya Yaśomitra, Part II (III and IV Kośasthāna), Bauddha Bharati Series 6, Varanasi.

Appendix 1: Selected terms in the Cakrabhedavastu

arūḍhi 15.2	mi 'chags 15.2a	mi skye ba 15.2b
cakrabhedavastu 15	'khor lo dbye ba'i gzhi 15a	'khor lo bye ba'i dngos po 15b
prthagbhāva 15.1	tha dad pa'i dngos po 15.1a	tha dad du 'gyur ba 15.1b
pratyavagati 15.3	shes 15.3a	gdon mi za ba 15.3b

Appendix 2: Index of the Sanskrit edition of the Cakrabhedavastu

adharmadharmaṃyos tathātvena pratyavagatāv ānantaryam || Svs 15.3

arūḍhir asyāsaṃghapariṃāṇatve bhidyamānānām asattve cānyeṣāṃ antaḥsīmni saṃghapariṃāṇānām || Svs 15.2

jñāpanato vā prthagbhāvasya dharmāt saṃghabhedāḥ śalākāgrahaṇato vānenārthena || Svs 15.1

dharmasaṃjñino 'pi bhede || Svs 15.4

Appendix 3: Index of the Tibetan translations of the Cakrabhedavastu

dge 'dun gyi dbyen ni chos las tha dad pa'i dngos por gsol bas sam don des tshul shing len du 'jug pas so || Tvs 15.1a

chos dang chos ma yin pa gnyis ka de bzhin du shes na mtshams med pa'o || Tvs 15.3a

chos dang chos ma yin pa de'i rang bzhin gyis gdon mi za bar na mtshams med pa'o || Tvs 15.3b

chos las tha dad du 'gyur ba ni gsol ba'am tshul shing len pa ste | de'i phyir gyis na dge 'dun gyi dbyen no || Tvs 15.1b

chos su 'du shes na'ang 'byed par ro || Tvs 15.4b

'di mi skye ba ni dge 'dun gyi tshad du cha med pa dang dbye bar byed pa na gzhan dang mtshams

kyi nang gi dge 'dun kyi tshad du med na'o || Tvs 15.2b

dbye ba la chos su 'du shes pas kyang ngo || Tvs 15.4a

dbye bar bya ba dag dge 'dun gyi tshad nyid ma yin pa dang | mtshams kyi nang na gzhan dge
'dun gyi tshad dag kyang med pa yin na de ni mi 'chags so || Tvs 15.2a

key words Guṇaprabha, Vinayasūtra, Cakrabhedavastu