

## Study on the Satyadvayavibhaṅga (3)

Ritsu AKAHANE

### 0. Introduction

For several years, I have studied *Satyadvayavibhaṅga* (tib. *bDen pa gnyis rnam par 'byed pa*) written by Jñānagarbha, which exists only as Tibetan translation in C & D now, nevertheless many questions about it remained unanswered. Most of them, I think, are posed not from the Indian original text but rather from the Tibetan translation. Therefore it may be the best way to solve these questions that we use its Tibetan commentaries. Unfortunately, however, so far it has not been possible to locate more than one single Tibetan commentary.<sup>1)</sup> Under these conditions, if we could find comments on SDV in some Tibetan texts, they might then help us to understand SDV more clearly. So I tried to find texts containing some important information about SDV, and I found one interesting text, namely, *Grub mtha' bzhi'i lugs kyi kun rdzob dang don dam pa'i don rnam par bshad pa* (bibliographical title: *bDen gnyis kyi rnam gzhag*,<sup>2)</sup> hereafter DN) written by Ngag dbang dpal ldan (ca. 19th cent.). Especially in its Rang rgyud pa's chapter, there are a number of citations from SDK, SDV and SDP, and also citations from some Tibetan commentaries on SDV.<sup>3)</sup> I could solve some questions, which had been unclear, through using DN. In this article, I would like to point out two interesting points among them and to make it clear what the original title of Dar ma rin chen's commentary on SDV known as *bDen gnyis kyi Dar tika is*.

### 1. On the question of k°9 bc

It is known that there are at least two versions about SDK k°9bc cited in some Tibetan texts. The one (= [a]) is the original version of SDV,<sup>4)</sup> and the other (= [b]) is different from it.<sup>5)</sup> In DN, [b] is cited and Ngag dbang dpal ldan makes a short

comment on it as follows:

[1] It is said in *SDV* that “(The negation of arising) is consistent with reality, so we consider it to be ultimate truth” (= [b]). But we cannot find it (= [b]) in *SDV* because as explained in *Dar ṭika*, [b] is extracted from the following commentary after k<sup>o</sup>9b in *SDV* as a verse. However, we should examine (which version is correct), because [b] is often cited as k<sup>o</sup>9bc in *rTsa she'i ṭika chen* and *stong thun etc.*<sup>6)</sup>

Ngag dbang dpal ldan insists that [b], though he cites it here, is not the correct version. And the same opinion is said to be also voiced in *Dar ma rin chen's* commentary, *bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika*. Therefore we should think that [b] is not correct. Despite this, however, Ngag dbang dpal ldan cites [b] in another part in *DN* again,<sup>7)</sup> and he reserves his judgement that [b] is not really correct. As a result we can find that [b] is more widely known than [a] in Tibet, though [b] is not correct.

## 2. On the question of *bsnan* or *brnan*

We can find the word *bsnan* used in *SDV* two times. And it is also used in *SDP* nine times, in which *bsnan* is used only in C and D, on the other hand, in G, N, and P, *brnan* is used for it. Considering that *SDV* remains only in C & D, it seems to be why *bsnan* is used in Eckel's edition. If it is so, we need to decide which word should be used in *SDV*, *bsnan* or *brnan*. *DN* gives us the key to solve this question. Ngag dbang dpal ldan cites k<sup>o</sup>8d and its commentary, and after that he comments as follows:

[2] “Real arising is constructed by the imagination and is incorrect relative truth. The word, *ni*, is the meaning of “intensifier(*brnan*)” or (indicates that) the word-order (of k<sup>o</sup>8d) is the contrary (=commentary part of k<sup>o</sup>8d in *SDV*.” ..... In some parts (in *SDV*), the word, *bsnan*, is used (for *brnan*), but it is obvious that *brnan* is (more) appropriate (than *bsnan*), because it is explained that *brnan* is the old word to mean “intensifier”.<sup>8)</sup>

As far as we can see [2], it is obvious that he intentionally cites the version of *SDV* in which *brnan* is used, which is different from Eckel's edition. As its ground, he insists that *brnan* is the old word for *nges bzung* which means “intensifier”, the function of the word *ni*, and similler explanation is also found in some Tibetan texts and dictionaries.<sup>9)</sup> Moreover, also in another part of *SDV*, *brnan* is used in the same context as in [2].<sup>10)</sup> Therefore we should rectify Eckel's edition of *SDV* from *bsnan*

to *brnan*.

### 3. What is the original title of *bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika*?

It is well known that Dar ma rin chen, one of the two greatest disciple of Tson kha pa, wrote the commentary on SDV, which is commonly known as *bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika* in Tibet, and it is cited in DN six times.<sup>1D</sup> Its original title, however, has not been known yet, because we cannot find it even in his collected works (gsung 'bum). What is its original title? Also for this question, we can find its key in DN. Another Tibetan commentary on SDV named *bDen gnyis kyi rnam bshad snying po gsal byed* is cited in DN only one time as follows.

[3] *bDen gnyis kyi rnam bshad snying po gsal byed las / dBu ma snang bar mdo'i don 'du byed dang de'i don dam pa gnyis gcig dang tha dad gang du yang bden par ma grub par sgrub par gsungs pa ltar rang rgyud pa rnam kyi bzhed dgos la / de ltar na bden gnyis bden grub 'gog pa'i rigs pa dgos pa'i phyir dang / ..... // zhes gsungs pa'i phyir / (DN: 102.7-103.1)*

Unfortunately I have not heard about its title until now. But we can find that a sentence of *bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika* cited in DN is verbatim the same as the underlined part in [3], as follows:

[4] *ji skad du / bDen gnyis Dar ṭikka las / dBu ma snang bar mdo'i don 'du byed dang de'i don dam pa gnyis gcig dang tha dad gang du yang bden par ma grub par sgrub par gsungs pa ltar Rang rgyud pa rnam kyi bzhed dgos la / zhes gsungs pa'i phyir dang / (DN: 157.3-4)*

According to this fact, it is probable that the original name of the text known as *bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika* is *bDen gnyis kyi rnam bshad snying po gsal byed*.

### 4. Conclusion

In this article, I pointed out the following three points.

1. The original verse k<sup>9</sup>bc is correct, but another version of it is better known in Tibet than the original one.
2. The word *bsnan* is used in Eckel's edition two times, but *brnan* is appropriate. Therefore we should rectify Eckel's edition from *bsnan* to *brnan*.
3. The original title of Dar ma rin chen's commentary on SDV known as *bDen gny-*

is *kyi Dar ṭika* is probably *bDen gnyis kyi rnam bshad snying po gsal byed*.

Abbreviations: C = Co ne ed.; D = sDe dge ed.; Eckel's edition = M.D.Eckel [1987] *Jñānagarbha on the Two Truths*, State University of New York press; G = dGa' ldan ed.; JIBS = Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies; MHTL = *Materials for a History of Tibetan Literature*. (Śata-piṭaka series) ed. L. Chandra. New Delhi: International Academy of Indian Culture, 1963; DN = *Grub mtha' bzhi'i lugs kyi kun rdzob dang don dam pa'i don rnam par bshad pa* of Ngag dbang dpal ldan PL480 (Set 1-6. LMPj-011046. R-1226), The Institute for the Advanced Studies of World Religions; P = Peking ed.; SDK = *Satyadvayavibhaṅgakārikā* of Jñānagarbha, D.3881; SDP = *Satyadvayavibhaṅgapañjikā* of Sāntarakṣita; SDV = *Satyadvayavibhaṅgavṛtti* of Jñānagarbha, D.3882.

- 1) I have already introduced one Tibetan commentary on SDV in my article. See, R. Akahane [2005] *Study on the Satyadvayavibhaṅga (2)* JIBS, no.53-2, pp.(41)-(44).
- 2) This bibliographical title can be found in MHTL 5782.
- 3) SDK, SDV, SDP (see, [List 1]) and Tibetan commentaries (see, [List 2]) are cited in dBu ma pa's chapter as follows.

[List 1]

| no. | SDK, SDV, & SDP                                 | DN (page, line of SDV)      |
|-----|---|-----------------------------|
| 1   | bDen gnyis (SDK: k°3)                           | 95.7-96.1                   |
| 2   | bDen pa gnyis (SDK: k°9abc*)                    | 126.7-127.1                 |
| 3   | bDen pa gnyis (SDK: k°11ab)                     | 127.1                       |
| 4   | bDen pa gnyis kyi 'grel pa (SDV: k°9ab)         | 127.1-2 (161, 4-9)*         |
| 5   | bDen gnyis (SDK: k°9bc*)                        | 127.5                       |
| 6   | bDen gnyis kyi 'grel pa (SDV: k°9b)             | 129.1 (161, 7-8)            |
| 7   | bDen gnyis kyi 'grel pa (SDV: k°8d)             | 129.2-4 (160, 29-32)*       |
| 8   | bDen gnyis rang 'grel (SDV: k°8abc)             | 130.6-131.1 (160, 19-24)    |
| 9   | bDen gnyis rang 'grel (SDV: k°8d)               | 131.1 (160, 26-28)          |
| 10  | bDen gnyis kyi dka' 'grel (SDP: k°8abc)         | 131.2-5 (D.24a2-4)          |
| 11  | bDen gnyis rang 'grel (SDV: k°8d)               | 131.5-6 (160, 29-31)        |
| 12  | bDen gnyis & de'i rang 'grel (SDV: k°8)         | 137.2-5 (163,21-164,3)      |
| 13  | bDen gnyis & de'i rang 'grel (SDK&SDV: k8)      | 138.1-5 (160, 4-16 & 26-28) |
| 14  | bDen gnyis & de'i 'grel pa (SDK&SDV: k°28 & 29) | 145.3-7 (181, 7-22)         |

\*Sentences are not verbatim.

[List 2]

| no. | Title of the commentary on SDV | DN          |
|-----|--------------------------------|-------------|
| 1   | bDen gnyis Dar ṭika            | 100.6-100.7 |

|   |   |             |
|---|---|-------------|
| 2 | bDen gnyis kyi rnam bshad snying po gsal byed             | 102.7-103.2 |
| 3 | bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika                                   | 127.5-6     |
| 4 | bDen gnyis Dar ṭika                                       | 139.1-2     |
| 5 | bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika                                   | 141.1-2     |
| 6 | bDen gnyis kyi Dar ṭika                                   | 146.7-147.1 |
| 7 | bDen gnyis kyi 'grel bshad (=SDP)                         | 148.3-4     |
| 8 | bDen gnyis Dar ṭika (citation in Thal 'gyur ba's chapter) | 157.3-4     |

- 4) yang dag pa dang mthun phyir 'dod // (k<sup>9</sup>b) don dam pa yin par kho bo cag 'dod do // gzhan dag ni yang dag pa kho nar ) ..... dgag bya yod pa ma yin pas // (SDV k<sup>9</sup>c).
- 5) yang dag pa dang mthun pa'i phyir // don dam yin par kho bos 'dod // (= [b]).
- 6) *bDen gnyis las* / yang dag pa dang mthun pa'i phyir // don dam yin par kho bos 'dod // (= another version of SDK k<sup>9</sup>bc) ces pa'di ni *bDen gnyis kyi dpe phal cher las mi 'byung zhing* / de'i *Dar ṭika las* / dpe kha cig tu / yang dag pa dang mthun pa'i phyir // don dam yin par kho bos 'dod // ces 'byung ba ni 'grel pa'i tshig 'og ma rtsa bar bris pa yin pas ma dag go // zhes gsungs kyañ / *rTsa she'i ṭika chen* dang *sTong thun* sogs las rtsa ba'i tshig yin par drangs snang bas spyad par bya'o // (DN: 127.5-6).
- 7) See, [List 1] no.2.
- 8) yang dag par skye ba la sogs pa gang yin pa de ni rtog pa'i bzos sbyar ba ste / de ni yang dag pa ma yin pa'i kun rdzob kyi bden pa'o // ni zhes bya ba ni brnan pa'i don tam go rims bzlog pa'o // zhes so // (commentary of k<sup>9</sup>d in SDV) ... / dpe kha cig tu *bsnan* zhes sa mgo can du byas 'dug kyang *brnan* zhes pa ni dag par mngon te / *brnan* pa zhes pa nges bzung gi brda rnying yin par bshad pa'i phyir ro // (DN: 138.5-139.1).
- 9) See, K. Mimaki [1992]: *Index to Two brDa gsar mññ Treatises: The Works of dBus pa blo gsal and lCañ skya Rol pa'i rdo rje*, Naritasan Bukkyōkenkyūjo kiyō 15, Naritasan shinshōi, p.486 & p.498.; See, Tibetan-Chinese dictionary (藏漢大辭典) p. 659.
- 10) ni zhes bya'i sgra ni bsnan pa'i don to // (Eckel's edition, p.156, ll.12).
- 11) See, [List 2].

\* For the translocation of SDK and SDV, see Eckel's edition.

(Key words) Jñānagarbha, Ngag dbang dpal ldan, Satyadvayavibhaṅga, Dar ma rin chen

(Part-time Lecturer, Osaka Gakuin University)